

Stability tests for dynamical systems and their applications

Eduardo Ibargüen-Mondragón¹

Abstract. In this paper we present two stability tests for systems of ordinary differential equations, the first test is for global stability while the second is for local stability. In addition, we use stability tests to analyze both the local and global stability of a nonlinear system of ordinary differential equations.

Keywords. Dynamical systems, Equilibrium solution, Stability.

Resumen. En este artículo se presentan dos criterios de estabilidad para sistemas de ecuaciones diferenciales ordinarias, el primer criterio es para estabilidad global mientras que el segundo es para estabilidad local. Además, los utilizamos para analizar la estabilidad local y global de un sistema no lineal de ecuaciones diferenciales ordinarias.

Palabras Clave. Sistemas dinámicos, Soluciones de equilibrio, Estabilidad.

1. Introduction

Analytical solutions of the nonlinear system of autonomous ordinary differential equations

$$\dot{x} = f(x), \tag{1.1}$$

where $f : \mathcal{D} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^n$ is a C^1 map and $\mathcal{D} \subset \mathbb{R}^n$ is an open set, can not always be explicitly determined. In 1892, A. M. Lyapunov developed his stability theory for nonlinear ordinary differential equations which characterizes the behavior of the dynamical systems trajectories in the sense that nearby solutions remain that way from now on (Hirsch and Smale, [9]). He established the *direct and indirect methods of Lyapunov* (DML and IML), very useful stability criteria for system (1.1). Currently, these methods are the most used to perform theoretical analysis of the stability of equilibrium solutions of (1.1). The main setback of the DML is find a Lyapunov function, because there is not a systematic method for finding. In the IML, determining the sign of the real part of the eigenvalues of the Jacobian matrix evaluated in equilibrium solutions is not always an easy task. For the above reasons, criteria that do not involve the explicit formulation of Lyapunov functions or avoid determining the

¹Corresponding author: Departamento de Matemáticas y Estadística, Facultad de Ciencias Exactas y Naturales, Universidad de Nariño, C. U. Torobajo, Clle 18 - Cra 50, PBX 27311449, Pasto, Colombia.e-mail: edbargun@udenar.edu.co.

sign of the real part of the eigenvalues are more practical to perform the stability analysis. In this paper we present two stability criteria developed by E. Iburguen et al. in [11,12], and we use them to analyze the stability of several dynamical systems.

2. First test of stability

In this section we establish a test for the asymptotic stability of the system (1.1) equilibrium when \mathcal{D} is an open subset of

$$\mathbb{R}_+^n = \{(x_1, \dots, x_n) \in \mathbb{R}^n : x_i \geq 0 \text{ for } i = 1, \dots, n\}.$$

The following proposition relates the equilibrium stability with the sign of certain determinants.

Proposition 2.1. *Let \mathcal{D} be an open subset of \mathbb{R}_+^n containing $\bar{x} = (\bar{x}_1, \dots, \bar{x}_n)$. Suppose that the function $f : \mathcal{D} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^n$ defined in (1.1) satisfies $f \in C^1(\mathcal{D})$ and $f(\bar{x}) = 0$. Let $\Delta_j(\bar{x})$ be the determinants defined by*

$$\Delta_j(\bar{x}) = (-1)^j \left| \begin{array}{c} a_j \frac{\partial f_j(\bar{x})}{\partial x_i} + \frac{a_i}{\bar{x}_i} \frac{\partial f_i(\bar{x})}{\partial x_j} \\ \bar{x}_j \end{array} \right|_{i=1, \dots, j}, \quad j = 1, \dots, n \quad (2.1)$$

where a_j is a positive constant.

1. If $\Delta_j(\bar{x})$ for $j = 1, \dots, n$ are positive, then \bar{x} is globally asymptotically stable.
2. If $\Delta_j(\bar{x})$ for $j = 1, \dots, n$ has alternate signs starting with a negative value, then \bar{x} is unstable.

See [11] for a proof of Proposition 2.1.

3. Second test of stability

The following result focus on determining conditions that allow us to establish the sign of the eigenvalues of $Df(\bar{x})$ through the Gershgorin circles (See, [12]).

Proposition 3.1. *Let \bar{x} an equilibrium point of (1.1),*

$$Df(\bar{x}) = \begin{pmatrix} J_{11} & J_{12} & \cdots & J_{1n} \\ J_{21} & J_{22} & \cdots & J_{2n} \\ \vdots & \vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\ J_{n1} & J_{n2} & \cdots & J_{nn} \end{pmatrix}, \quad (3.1)$$

the Jacobian matrix of (1.1) evaluated in \bar{x} and

$$R_i = \sum_{j=1, j \neq i}^n |J_{ij}|, \quad (3.2)$$

for $i = 1, \dots, n$. If $J_{ii} < 0$ and $R_i < |J_{ii}|$ for $i = 1, \dots, n$ then \bar{x} is locally asymptotically stable.

See [12] for a proof of Proposition 3.1. The following result is a consequence of the Proposition 3.1.

Corollary 3.2. *Let \bar{x} an equilibrium point of (1.1), $Df(\bar{x})$ defined in (3.1), and*

$$R_j = \sum_{i=1, i \neq j}^n |J_{ij}|, \quad (3.3)$$

for $j = 1, \dots, n$. If $J_{jj} < 0$ and $R_j < |J_{jj}|$ for $j = 1, \dots, n$ then \bar{x} is locally asymptotically stable.

4. Application of stability tests

In this section we apply the two tests formulated in Section 3 to analyze the stability of the following system of ordinary differential equation

$$\frac{dx_j}{dt} = \alpha_j x_j (1 - x_j) - \sigma_j \prod_{i=1}^n x_i, \quad j = 1, 2, \dots, n, \quad (4.1)$$

where $0 < \alpha_j < 1$ and $0 < \sigma_j < 1$ for $j = 1, 2, \dots, n$.

4.1. Stability analysis by test 1

Let

$$\mathcal{D}_1 = \{x \in \mathbb{R}^n : 0 < x_j < 1, j = 1, 2, \dots, n\}. \quad (4.2)$$

The following lemma ensures that all solutions of (4.1) starting in the closure of \mathcal{D}_1 denoted by \mathcal{D}_1 , remain there for all $t \geq 0$.

Lema 4.1. *The set \mathcal{D}_1 defined in (4.2) is positively invariant for the solutions of the system (4.1).*

See [11] for a proof of Lemma 4.1. The next proposition summarizes existent results of the equilibrium solutions of (4.1).

Proposition 4.2. *The system (4.1) has at least $2^n + 1$ equilibrium solution in \mathcal{D}_1 .*

To proof the following proposition we use the first test of stability.

Proposition 4.3. *Suppose that the system (4.1) has an interior steady state $\bar{x} \in \mathcal{D}_2 \subset \mathcal{D}_1$ where*

$$\mathcal{D}_2 = \{x \in \mathbb{R}^n : 0 < x_i < 1, 0 < x_i + x_j < 1 \ i, j = 1, 2, \dots, n\}.$$

then this steady state is globally asymptotically stable on the interior set of \mathcal{D}_1 .

Proof. From (4.1) we conclude that:

$$f_j(x) = \alpha_j x_j (1 - x_j) - \sigma_j \prod_{k=1}^n x_k, \quad j = 1, 2, \dots, n,$$

which implies that

$$\frac{\partial f_j(\bar{x})}{\partial \bar{x}_j} = \alpha_j (1 - \bar{x}_j) - \alpha_j \bar{x}_j - \sigma_j \prod_{k=1, k \neq j}^n \bar{x}_k, \quad j = 1, 2, \dots, n. \quad (4.3)$$

From equilibrium equations we have:

$$\alpha_j (1 - \bar{x}_j) - \sigma_j \prod_{k=1, k \neq j}^n \bar{x}_k = 0, \quad j = 1, 2, \dots, n. \quad (4.4)$$

Therefore, substituting (4.4) in (4.3) we verify the first hypothesis of Proposition 2.1, that is

$$\frac{\partial f_j(\bar{x})}{\partial \bar{x}_j} = -\alpha_j \bar{x}_j < 0, \quad j = 1, 2, \dots, n.$$

On the other hand,

$$\begin{aligned} l_{ij}(\bar{x}) &= \left(\frac{\partial f_i(\bar{x})}{\partial x_i} \right)^{-1} \frac{\partial f_i(\bar{x})}{\partial x_j} + \left(\frac{\partial f_j(\bar{x})}{\partial x_j} \right)^{-1} \frac{\partial f_j(\bar{x})}{\partial x_i} \\ &= (-\alpha_i \bar{x}_i)^{-1} \left(-\sigma_i \prod_{k=1, k \neq j}^n \bar{x}_k \right) + (-\alpha_j \bar{x}_j)^{-1} \left(-\sigma_j \prod_{k=1, k \neq i}^n \bar{x}_k \right) \\ &= \left(\frac{\sigma_i}{\alpha_i} + \frac{\sigma_j}{\alpha_j} \right) \prod_{k=1, k \neq i, k \neq j}^n \bar{x}_k. \end{aligned} \quad (4.5)$$

From (4.4) we have:

$$\frac{\sigma_j}{\alpha_j} = \frac{1 - \bar{x}_j}{\prod_{k=1, k \neq j}^n \bar{x}_k}, \quad j = 1, 2, \dots, n. \quad (4.6)$$

Substituting (4.6) in (4.5) we obtain:

$$l_{ij}(\bar{x}) = \frac{1 - \bar{x}_i}{\bar{x}_j} + \frac{1 - \bar{x}_j}{\bar{x}_i}, \quad \text{for } i \neq j.$$

From hypothesis $\bar{x} \in \mathcal{D}_2$, results that $0 < \bar{x}_i + \bar{x}_j < 1$ which implies $(\bar{x}_i + \bar{x}_j)^2 < \bar{x}_i + \bar{x}_j$, or equivalently $(1 - \bar{x}_i)\bar{x}_i + (1 - \bar{x}_j)\bar{x}_j > 2\bar{x}_i\bar{x}_j$. The above implies that the second hypothesis of Proposition 2.1 is satisfied. That is $l_{ij} > 2$. Therefore \bar{x} is globally asymptotically stable on interior set of \mathcal{D}_1 . \checkmark

Proposition 2.1 can be used to analyze the local stability for SIR model, SEIR Model, among other [2, 4, 5, 7, 8].

4.2. Stability analysis by test 2

Let $n = 2$, then the system (4.1) is written as

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{dx_1}{dt} &= \alpha_1 x_1 (1 - x_1) - \sigma_1 x_1 x_2 \\ \frac{dx_2}{dt} &= \alpha_1 x_2 (1 - x_2) - \sigma_2 x_1 x_2. \end{aligned} \quad (4.7)$$

The equilibrium solution of (4.7) are

$$\begin{aligned} E_1 &= (0, 0) \quad , \quad E_2 = (1, 0) \\ E_3 &= (0, 1) \quad , \quad E_4 = (x_1^*, x_2^*), \end{aligned} \quad (4.8)$$

where

$$x_1^* = \frac{1 - \frac{\sigma_1}{\alpha_1}}{1 - \frac{\sigma_1 \sigma_2}{\alpha_1 \alpha_2}} \quad \text{and} \quad x_2^* = \frac{1 - \frac{\sigma_2}{\alpha_2}}{1 - \frac{\sigma_1 \sigma_2}{\alpha_1 \alpha_2}}. \quad (4.9)$$

Notice that $0 < x_1^* < 1$ and $0 < x_2^* < 1$. The Jacobian matrix of (4.7) is given by

$$J(x) = \begin{pmatrix} \alpha_1(1 - 2x_1) - \sigma_1 x_2 & -\sigma_1 x_1 \\ -\sigma_2 x_2 & \alpha_2(1 - 2x_2) - \sigma_2 x_1 \end{pmatrix}. \quad (4.10)$$

Evaluating (4.10) in equilibria E_i for $i = 1, \dots, 4$ we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} J(E_1) &= \begin{pmatrix} \alpha_1 & 0 \\ 0 & \alpha_2 \end{pmatrix}, & J(E_2) &= \begin{pmatrix} -\alpha_1 & -\sigma_1 \\ 0 & \alpha_2 - \sigma_2 \end{pmatrix} \\ J(E_3) &= \begin{pmatrix} \alpha_1 - \sigma_1 & 0 \\ -\sigma_2 & -\alpha_2 \end{pmatrix}, & J(E_4) &= \begin{pmatrix} -\alpha_1 x_1^* & -\sigma_1 x_1^* \\ -\alpha_2 x_2^* & -\sigma_2 x_2^* \end{pmatrix}. \end{aligned} \quad (4.11)$$

Notice that $J(E_4)$ satisfies the hypothesis $J_{ii} < 0$ for $i = 1, 2$ of Proposition 3.1. To $J(E_3)$ and $J(E_2)$ the above hypothesis is satisfied when $\alpha_1 < \sigma_1$ and $\alpha_2 < \sigma_2$, respectively, and $J(E_1)$ does not satisfy the condition. On the other hand, to $J(E_3)$ and $J(E_2)$ the hypothesis $R_i < |J_{ii}|$ for $j = 1, 2$ is satisfied when $\sigma_2 < \alpha_2$ and $\sigma_1 < \alpha_1$, respectively, to $J(E_4)$ the hypothesis is satisfied when $\alpha_1 > \sigma_1$ and $\alpha_2 > \sigma_2$. Therefore, if $\alpha_1 < \sigma_1$ and $\sigma_2 < \alpha_2$ then E_3 is locally asymptotically stable, if $\alpha_2 < \sigma_2$ and $\sigma_1 < \alpha_1$ then E_2 is locally asymptotically stable, and if $\alpha_1 > \sigma_1$ and $\alpha_2 > \sigma_2$ then E_4 is locally asymptotically stable.

Proposition 3.1 can be used to analyze the global stability of several models [1, 7, 13–31].

5. Discussion

Qualitative analysis of dynamical systems is relevant to determine the behavior of their solutions. The direct and indirect methods of Lyapunov are the most used. However, in a wide range of models, applying them, it is a difficult task to perform. In this sense, efforts have been made to make these criteria much more practical tools to carry out the stability analysis of equilibrium solutions. Other well-known techniques are the next generation matrix method and the Routh-Hurwitz criterion [3, 10, 32]. Stability tests formulated in Sections 2 and 3 are useful in several areas of mathematics and engineering sciences. First test can be used to analyze global stability and the second one to analyze local stability. Both of them are practical tools to determine stability of systems of ordinary differential equations. They are not robust as those mentioned above. However, they are very simple and practical tools to analyze the stability of equilibrium points.

Referencias

- [1] Cerón M., Ibargüen-Mondragón E., López-Molano P. (2020). Global stability analysis for a model with carriers and non-linear incidence rate, *Journal of Biological dynamics*, 14(1), 409-420. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17513758.2020.1772998> 5
- [2] Díaz Moncayo M., Ascuntar Rojas D. (2017). *El aislamiento como medida de control ante la prevalencia del virus de la influenza Tipo A en San Juan de Pasto*, Tesis de Licenciatura, universidad de Nariño. 4
- [3] Diekmann O., Heesterbeek JAP., Metz JAJ. (1990). On the definition and the computation of the basic reproduction ratio R_0 in models for infectious diseases in heterogeneous populations, *Journal of Mathematical Biology*, (28), 365-382. <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00178324> 5
- [4] Esteva L., Ibargüen-Mondragón E. (2018). Modeling basic aspects of bacterial resistance of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* to antibiotics, *Ricerche di Matematica*, 67(1), 69-88. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11587-017-0347-7> 4
- [5] Gómez Hernández EA., Ibargüen-Mondragón E. (2018). Modeling the Dynamics of the Mosquito *Anopheles calderoni* Transmitters of Malaria, *Contemporary Engineering Sciences*, 11(2), 871 - 879. <https://doi.org/10.12988/ces.2018.8380> 4

- [6] Gómez-Hernández EA., González-Santacruz EC., Ibagüen-Mondragón E. (2014). Elementos para la modelación matemática de la epidemiología de la neumonía, *Universidad y Salud*, 16(2), 219-227. 4, 5
- [7] Gómez Hernández EA, Ibagüen-Mondragón E, Salazar Jurado EH, Prieto K. (2020). Modelo multiparce y multigrupo para la transmisión de la malaria, *Ciencia en Desarrollo*, 11(1), 49-61. <https://doi.org/10.19053/01217488.v11.n1.2020.10433> 4, 5
- [8] Hidalgo-Bonilla SP. et al. (2018). Mathematical modeling on bacterial isolates for different concentrations of hexavelant chromium, *Biomath Communications Supplement*, 5(1), 1-2. 4
- [9] Hirsch M., Smale S. (1974). *Differential Equations-Dynamical Systems and Linear Algebra*, Academic Press, New York. 1
- [10] Hurwitz A. (1964). On the conditions under which an equation has only roots with negative real parts. Selected papers on mathematical trends in control theory, 65, 273-284. 5
- [11] Ibagüen-Mondragón M., Cerón M., Romero J. (2014) A simple test for asymptotic stability in some dynamical systems *Revista de Ciencias* **18** 21-32. 2, 3
- [12] Ibagüen-Mondragón M, Ortega D, Gómez-Hernández EA. (2018) Stability Test for Non Linear Systems of Ordinary Differential Equations Based on the Gershgorin Circles. *Contemporary Engineering Sciences* **11** 4541-4548. <https://doi.org/10.12988/ces.2018.89504> 2
- [13] Ibagüen-Mondragón E., Esteva L. (2014). On the interactions of sensitive and resistant Mycobacterium tuberculosis to antibiotics, *Mathematical Biosciences*, 246(1), 84-93. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mbs.2013.08.005> 5
- [14] Ibagüen-Mondragón E. et al. (2014). Mathematical modeling on bacterial resistance to multiple antibiotics caused by spontaneous mutations, *Biosystems*, 117, 60-57. 5
- [15] Ibagüen-Mondragón E., Esteva L., Chávez-Galán L., (2011), A mathematical model for cellular immunology of tuberculosis, *Mathematical Biosciences and Engineering*, 8(4), 973-986. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biosystems.2014.01.005> 5
- [16] Ibagüen-Mondragón I., et al. (2016). Mathematical modeling of bacterial resistance to antibiotics by mutations and plasmids, *Journal of Biological Systems*, 24(01), 129-146. 5
- [17] Ibagüen-Mondragón E., Esteva L. (2014). On CTL Response against Mycobacterium tuberculosis, *Applied Mathematical Sciences*, 8(48), 2383-2389. <https://doi.org/10.1142/S0218339016500078> 5
- [18] Ibagüen Mondragón E., Esteva L., Burbano-Rosero EM. (2018). Mathematical model for the growth of Mycobacterium tuberculosis in the granuloma. *Mathematical Biosciences and Engineering*, 15(2), 407-428. doi: 10.3934/mbe.2018018 5
- [19] Ibagüen Mondragón E., Esteva L. (2012), Un modelo matemático sobre la dinámica del Mycobacterium tuberculosis en el granuloma, *Revista Colombiana de Matemáticas*, 46(1), 39-65. 5
- [20] Ibagüen-Mondragón, Galeano LA., Gómez-Hernández EA. (2017). Qualitative analysis of a mathematical model for kinetic mechanisms of complete mineralization of Phenol by Fe, *Applied Mathematical Sciences*, 11(26), 1261-1269. <https://doi.org/10.12988/ams.2017.7393> 5

- [21] Ibargüen-Mondragón E., Esteva L., Chávez-Galán L. (2010). Estabilidad global para un modelo matemático sobre la respuesta inmune innata de macrófagos contra el *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*, *Revista Sigma*, 10(1), 1-17. [5](#)
- [22] Ibargüen Mondragón E., Esteva L. (2016). Simple mathematical models on macrophages and CTL responses against *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*, *Revista Sigma*, 10(2), 31-43. [5](#)
- [23] Ibargüen Mondragón E., Romero-Leiton JP., Esteva L., Cerón Gómez M., Hidalgo-Bonilla SP (2019), Stability and periodic solutions for a model of bacterial resistance to antibiotics caused by mutations and plasmids, *Applied Mathematical Modelling*, 76, 238 - 251. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apm.2019.06.017> [5](#)
- [24] Ibargüen-Mondragón E., (2102), Modelos matemáticos sobre la interacción de macrófagos, células T y el *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*, *Ecomatemático*, 3(1), 11-13. [5](#)
- [25] Ibargüen-Mondragón E, et al. (2020). Mathematical modelling of MS2 virus inactivation by Al/Fe-PILC-activated catalytic wet peroxide oxidation (CWPO), *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, 27:19836-19844. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-020-08365-4> [5](#)
- [26] Montoya Aguilar JM., Romero-Leiton JP., Ibargüen Mondragón E. (2018) Qualitative analysis of a mathematical model applied to malaria disease transmission in Tumaco (Colombia), *Applied Mathematical Sciences*, 12(5), 205-217. <https://doi.org/10.12988/ams.2018.817> [5](#)
- [27] Romero Leiton J.,Ibarguen-Mondragon E., Esteva L., Un modelo matemático sobre bacterias sensibles y resistentes a antibióticos, *Matemáticas: Enseñanza Universitaria*, 2011, 19(2), 55-73. [5](#)
- [28] Romero Leiton J.,Ibarguen-Mondragon E., Sobre la resistencia bacteriana hacia antibióticos de acción bactericida y bacteriostática, *Revista Integración*, 2014, 32(1), 101-116. [5](#)
- [29] Romero Leiton J., Montoya Aguilar J., Villaroel M., Ibargüen-Mondragon E., Influencia de la Fuerza de Infección y La Transmisión Vertical en la Malaria: Modelado Matemático, *Revista Facultad de Ciencias Básicas*, 2017, 13(1), 4-18. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.18359/rfcb.2198> [5](#)
- [30] Romero-Leiton JP., Montoya Aguilar JM., Ibargüen-Mondragón E. (2018). An optimal control problem applied to malaria disease in Colombia, *Applied Mathematical Sciences*, 12(6), 279-292. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40314-019-0909-2> [5](#)
- [31] Romero JP., Ibargüen Mondragón E., Pulgarín A., Cordero D., Castaño IP. (2016). Análisis de un modelo planta-herbívoro aplicado a la interacción gramínea-bovino, *Revista de Matemática: Teoría y Aplicaciones*, 23(2), 489-506. DOI 10.15517/RM-TA.V23I2.25287 [5](#)
- [32] Routh EJ. (1877). *A treatise on the stability of a given state of motion: particularly steady motion*, London, Macmillan and Company. [5](#)